

Market Development of Cultural Services as “Functionings” of Amartya Sen’s Capability Approach

Mr. Ganpat Prajapati¹

I. Introduction

It is proposed that an understanding of Amartya Sen’s capability approach in particular and human resource development perspective in general could help in positioning strategy for cultural services and find a rationale for market development and marketing framework, as with any of the basic services that are intrinsic to Amartya Sen’s capability approach. While supply side definitely is responsive in resource allocation to technology oriented, mass consumption and discreet consumption service products for which consumer demand exists and is expanding in response to environment of innovation. However, as it is necessary to pull out all stops for extension of supply of basic services like education and health (understood as broad and holistic construct) and probably cultural(though not considered basic) as it has primary role in human development as per capability approach. Services provisioning process and delivery are people centric as well as employment oriented. In developing world and particularly in India of second decade of 21st century, to provide for migrating rural work force and partly employed urban workforce from informal economy, services sector provides a natural fit. However, if this environmental factor is to be promoted as of strategic significance, policy makers need to priorities resource allocation with a fresh perspective on an unprecedented scale for which capability approach provide an apt rationale. The aim of this study is to understand capability approach and its relevance to the market development and marketing framework for cultural services in general and yoga service in particular.

Considering that services sector as an economic activity is a predominant employment generator and absorbing surplus labour from India’s hinterland, and that contribution of agriculture and manufacturing in GDP and employment in manufacturing has plateau, it makes sense that services sector is promoted as a priority in India’s policy making and resource allocation. To further the argument, this study argues that even from capability approach perspective, there is a scope for market creation and development in services sector. With particular reference to cultural services as yoga, the study proposes that in capability approach, freedom of choice that the individual must have so that he is capable of choosing the functionings is more about activities that an individual will be required to undertake, partly with the aid of commodities. Sen’s work in social choice theory and welfare economics has provided a framework in which policies can be derived socially in order to address and alleviate economic problems. For Sen, the end-purpose of economic development is overcoming problems which make life difficult by way of “increasing capabilities, or in freedoms to achieve, reducing inequalities in capabilities, in consequence of the awakening of agency freedom in those who are disadvantaged. People playing agency roles activate their latent capability sets and, hence, are endowed with increased functionings”. Sen, A. (1995) “Rationality and Social Choice,” *American Economic Review* 85(1): 1–24; (Hans E. Jensen, Betsy Jane Clary and Wilfred Dolfsma, “Sen on Public Policy: Private Incentives, Public Virtues”? *Review of Social Economy* Vol. LXVIII, No. 2, June 2010 *Speaker’s Corner* online 2010 *The Association for Social Economics*).

Human Development Reports refer the term ‘expand people’s choices’ in place of the ‘capabilities’. This phrase could ignore the issues of ‘value’ and ‘have reason to value’ that are central to capabilities. Actually the capability approach is not about expanding the number of choices – but the quality of human life. People also value making some choices – as a family or a community – rather than individually. Also, many capabilities are necessarily the outcome of joint process, not individual decisions. The capability approach’s reference to concept such as ‘real freedoms’ is an attempt to express congruence with cultural context and social arena which may limit those freedoms.

Market Development Logic Vs Capability “Entitlement”

It is proposed in this study that the capability approach need not necessarily be entitlements based supply side but could be market based which gains from both public and private intervention. As the

¹Ph.D. Scholar, Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur

functionings are essentially service sector products, the provisioning process would generate capability builders in an economic process reflective of people centric, co-production and consumption activities. Extension of functionings to cover cultural activities like yoga as market based service product would also lead to demand pull reducing the pressure on public finances and simultaneously, consumption of cultural services could lead to cognitive development, wellbeing and social capital.

II. Capability Approach- Functionings, Capabilities and Agency Role

Formulations of capability have two parts: functionings and opportunity freedom - the two concepts combined together in Sen's approach. **Functionings** are "being" and "doing activities" that people "value and have reason to value". Examples are: being nourished, literate and employed. However, functionings are not limited, which is why the human development approach applies to rich and poor countries, and to rich and poor people. Functionings relate to many different dimensions of life – including survival, health, work, education, relationships, empowerment, self-expression and culture with materials in use (Sen, 1987, p23). Firstly, as things of "value" for a person, an activity or situation 'counts' as a functioning for that person only if that person values it. Second, functionings are things people 'have reason to value'. Value judgement in capability approach is very important as it brings people of similar values together and help them participate. This also works for them who has a stake in the functioning, creating a motivational pull. The people with negative value gets weeded out as a result of social system.

Capabilities are the freedom to choose and enjoy functionings as valued by the individuals. It is like currency in the pocket enabling a person to choose between different combinations of "what is valued". So they combine among various functionings with a kind of freedom of choice, a person with many capabilities can elect between many different functionings and pursue a variety of different life paths. Capabilities are real and actual possibilities available to choose from for a person. This implies actual choice made with reference to feasibility and with ability to follow up with functionings. As T. H. Green wrote, 'We do not mean merely freedom from restraint or compulsion ... when we speak of freedom as something to be so highly prized, we mean a positive power or capacity of doing or enjoying something worth doing or enjoying' (cited in Sen, 2002b, p586).

Agency The third core concept of the capability approach is agency. Agency refers to a person's ability to pursue and realize goals that an individual "values and has reason to value". An agent is 'someone who acts and brings about change' on his own volition without force or coercion. (Sen, 1999, p19). It is also what a person can do in line with his or her conception of the good' (Sen, 1985, p206). Agency expands the horizons of concern beyond a person's own well-being to include concerns for others. This enables people to be active and creative, with the ability to act on behalf of others within their aspirations.

Agency is related to other approaches that stress self-determination, authentic self-direction, autonomy, self-reliance, empowerment, voice and so on. The strong collective desire for agency suggests that development processes should foster participation, public debate and democratic practice.

Agency is necessarily plural in both concept and measurement. In Sen's view:

- It is exercised with respect to the goals the person values and has reason to value.
- It includes not just individual agency, but what one can do as a member of a group.
- Agency goals include well-being of self or family or community, of other people at large like promotion of art.
- To identify agency entails agent's goal assessment to determine reasonableness to be an effective agency.
- The agent's responsibility to act as an agent is well understood.

(Extract from Ingrid Robeyns (2005) 'The capability approach – a theoretical survey', Journal of Human Development, vol 6, no 1, pp102–103).

This implies that capability approach relies on the agency and involves people as per contexts or on basis of "what is of value to specific group and deciding which capabilities to focus on". This creates scope for coming together of people, formal/informal groups, communities and organizations. Martha Nussbaum, has proposed a list of ten central human capabilities that, she argues, should be the essential minimum (Nussbaum, 1988, p175). Her list of central human capabilities is as follows (Nussbaum, 2000, pp78–80):

Life: Being able to live life of normal length.

Bodily health: Being able to have good health, adequately nourished; with adequate shelter.

Bodily integrity: Being able to move.

Senses, imagination and thought: being able to use one's mind protected by freedom of expression, freedom of religious exercise; being able to have pleasurable experiences.

Emotions: not having one's emotional development affected by fear and anxiety.

Practical reason: includes liberty of conscience and of religious observance.

Affiliation: to engage in various forms of social interaction; with empathy, includes freedom of assembly and political speech. (B) Having the social bases of self-respect and non-humiliation and non-discrimination.

Other species: Being able to live with concern for and in relation to animals, plants, and the world of nature.

Play: Being able to laugh, to play and to enjoy recreational activities.

Control over one's environment: (A) Political: (B) Material: having property rights and having the right to seek employment on an equal basis with others; freedom from unwarranted search and seizure, in being able to work as a human being in work situation.

The key questions to keep in mind when selecting capabilities are: (1) which capabilities do the people who will enjoy them value (and attach a high priority to); and (2) which capabilities are relevant as per institution's policy? The functionings provide a list of goal posts for policy makers in pursuit of development so that people can avail of them singly or in groups. Aligning provisioning process of basic services and infrastructure for other services including social services would then make available access to functionings as per "values" held individually or socially. The development process is one in which agency roles, capability sets, and, hence, functionings are mobilized along with the expansion of the resource base of primary goods. While development, leading to increased well-being, depends on appropriate policy implementation and the choice of appropriate policy targets, the development process begins with the awakening of the agent's (an individual's) desire to realize her "goals" in the form of "functioning achievements." A person's capability set, such as meeting nutritional requirements, depends on "the entitlement relations that govern possession and use in that society" (Sen 1981: pp 154).

While basic services as education and health service are provided as entitlement in India, could there be a case for expanded menu of functionings be added to the entitlements as a state policy? Institutional intervention of this nature is required in a services sector dominant economy moving away from engagement of number of people on farms and merchandise manufacturing sector becoming very capital intensive affording less number of "opportunity freedoms" for functionings to happen. As to macro economic goals for an economy, productive engagement of people can only happen in "doing and being" where merchandise input in value terms per person would not be or should not be a significant factor for resource allotment and a limiting factor to allocate resources to capability approach.

A functioning, then, is the actual thing that a person does. A person's ability "to do certain basic things," such as meeting "nutritional requirements," as well as a person's ability to realize further refined capabilities which create finer achievements. The aggregation of a person's functionings represent actual achievements, and "the capability set represents the freedom to achieve"—the different combinations of functionings from which a person can choose (Sen 1999a: 75). Development leads to increased well-being and the development process begins when an individual or a social unit as agent desires to realize her "goals" in the form of "functioning achievements."

The role of cultural services in capability development can be gauged from looking at the list of functionings that are expected to be "actual achievements" to enable a person live life that he values, "doing and being". Ranis, Stewart and Samman (2006) identified 11 parameters of human development which included mental well-being, empowerment, political freedom, social relations, community well-being, inequality, work conditions, leisure conditions, economic stability, political security and environment conditions. (Ref. Chapter 6: introduction to Capability Approach) The selected missing dimensions of well-being are (Alkire, 2007, p348): employment: particularly informal employment and safety at work; empowerment or agency: the ability to advance goals one values and has reason to value; physical safety: focusing on security from violence to property and person, and perceived violence; the ability to go about without shame: to emphasize the importance of dignity, respect and freedom from humiliation, and psychological and subjective well-being: to emphasize meaning, its determinants, and satisfaction.

Sen argues that we should focus directly on people's beings and doings. His emphasis is on abilities to convert the primary goods into what people are able to be and do in their lives in comparison to commodities alone as capabilities. In this sense, capabilities are also operand resources as versus commodities in which they work which are operand resources in Service Delivery Logic of new services marketing. Primary goods are the means with which to pursue one's life goals. "But the real opportunities or possibilities that a person has is not determined by the primary goods that she has access to, but also by a range of factors that determine to what extent she can turn these primary goods into valuable states of being and doing. Hence, Sen claims that we should focus on the extent of freedom that a person has, that is, her actual capabilities".(citing Sen, in "an Introduction to the Human Development and Capability Development" Pp134). This study proposes to study the range of factors which are essentially operand resources as versus commodities which are made available as entitlements by an institutional or governmental or public policy in an agency role to help an individual to make choice for the self and for the society for "being" and "doing".

Thus according to standard economic measures, there is less poverty in Haryana, than in Kerala, but longevity index better, almost 100% literacy as compared to Haryana, female , infant mortality than in Kerala, and higher illiteracy. This could explain how better access to public health and education is able to achieve a higher level of functioning than in Haryana. The comparison of growth rate from 1996 to 2006 shows improvement as the HDI showed improvement suggesting that with better intrinsic value of the functionings, they served as an instrumental value as well, in achieving higher growth a decade later. This could mean that resource allocation for public services positively impacts development rate than only business investments.

III. Market Development of Basic services and Cultural Services

The Nussbaum's list of functionings and list of development goal posts indicate that services sector has a significant role to play if services provisioning and delivery process is taken up in earnest. What is important is not that only public services as in case of Kerala can make development growth faster but that private sector efficiency in basic services delivery compared to public services can also be helpful. The gaps observed in present approach should be corrected for this purpose. The core argument of present study is that Capability Approach as a vehicle for human development could be supplemented as follows.

Market development for a service process and delivery framework that helps in Capability Development and to promote partaking of basic services when provided (or supplied).

Role of formal and informal institutions to supplement public sector delivery of basic services. Once markets are understood to be institutions connected to a whole range of formal and informal institutions – including being embedded in deeper social and cultural norms and networks – the importance of enabling them to enhance human freedoms and well-being, however difficult, becomes apparent.

How Provisioning and Delivery of Cultural services, particularly performing arts including yoga, sports, urban spaces and centers of public participation can help in building social structures, networks, skill sets and uplifting disadvantaged groups as Capability Approach and as developmental approach.

Social infrastructure development as significant public sector input.

Life style statement – a way to live – attaining "Aristotelian flourishing" as an economic objective for sustainability and as a way of life for according priority to basic services and cultural services delivery.

People centered production and consumption process – Services sector as an economic activity encompassing basic and cultural service.

IV. Market development

It implies creation of infrastructure for the process of services delivery and services distribution. Marketing of cultural services and basic services such as education and health could not be possible if one were to take into account low level of motivation for consumption and low level of efforts to promote in an environment where it is majorly provided by government and public institutions. As a result of this mismatch, there is a need to explore possibility of market creation for services for capability creation in capability approach.

This means individuals have a capability to make a free choice as choices are available and that these individuals are able to meet that choice because they exercise free will and that they know that they can make that choice because they can take consequent action in terms of functionings such as getting education that make sense to them and they can empower themselves with healthy life leading to well being and long life expectancy. As Sen says availabilities of the commodities alone don't make wellbeing happen and do not create capability. This is where the services sector in general and provisioning and delivery of basic services as education imparting value driven decision making abilities as a way of life training is necessary. Likewise, health provisioning also includes all preventive measures to be taken collectively as well as educating oneself about lifestyle infirmities, disabilities and ailments and ways of following healthy life style.

One of the challenges, from an individual's point of view is that of agency role for undertaking necessary functionings when enabling capabilities are made available. The functionings could be delivered more effectively if it were an integrated approach for major functionings such as education, health, cultural activities, sports, physical activities, participatory activities on an integrated capabilities platform provided by government agencies, non-profit sector, private sector, self-help groups, cooperatives, informal community groups etc. Composite response could elicit better response from individuals as more consumption motives would be combined and services process and delivery model could be as per nature and objectives of organizations and target groups. Multiplicity of institutional approach would ensure universal coverage and competitive forces ensuring quality of delivery.

V. Formal and informal institutions

When the role of institutions is discussed, formal and informal or profit and non-profit, both kind of institutions could be relevant. North(1990) suggests that informal institutions are based on conventions, moral rules and social norms that are commonly accepted in society reflecting the customs, traditions, values or ways of life of a particular society or group, the transgression of which generally leads to social ostracism. Jon Elster (1989, p105) defines a social norm as "the propensity to feel shame and to anticipate sanction by others at the thought of behaving in a certain, forbidden way. This propensity becomes a social norm when and to the extent that it is shared with other people". Some norms come in the way of capability development and some encourage. While looking at the role of institutions, this could be kept in mind that going by positive impact, both kinds of institutions could play useful and complimentary **agency** role to reach out to larger target group.

Resource allocation which necessarily includes human resource as we are dealing with developing capabilities empowering a will to choose freely of an individual and functionings which are activities to do and to be ultimately by human beings partly also aided by commodities in some cases, would be facilitated by participation of multiplicity of agencies, individual and collectives, formal and non-formal, profit and non-profit as mobilization of human resource requires extensive reach and wide appeal to varied target group which will need different set of motivations on either side of services process provisioning and delivery.

Formal institutions or organizations might seek to change the rules that incentivize members into capability building for menu of functionings as per their interests for which they become members of that institution whereas some constrain them from freedom of choice. As a consequence, when actors seek to innovate and create new opportunities, what they are ultimately able to achieve is constrained by existing institutions – both formal and informal – and economic development is therefore 'path-dependent'. North's approach identifies the problems of imperfect and asymmetrical information. In such scenario, large number of players and stakeholders could provide segment targeted, marketing oriented efficiency which, considering paucity of resources, would certainly be welcome. What is more, as services provisioning and delivery processes are people centric and targeted at different groups with different interests at different level of "need" to be converted to "want", formal and informal institutions could have positive impact on capabilities and functionings. Harriss-White's (2003a, 2004) study of the Indian economy shows that social relations in the workforce and social class, gender, religion, caste and space interact in complex ways with each other to create a 'socially regulated' economy creating a role for informal institutions in services delivery.

Multiple institutions help in development and the expansion of freedoms of choice e.g. the capability of women to read and write can be affected by social norms like hostility to gender equality. The human development and capability approach to the institutional framework is the recognition of the participatory environment, whether market or non-market, so they can provide multiple opportunities and freedoms for people to live the lives they have reason to value while participants meet challenges of life. Sen (1999, p112) emphasizes the value of the freedom to participate in markets. When the economic system, whatever it is, functions in a way that does not enable people to be agents of their own lives, the system could be inefficient

and unjust. (Drèze, J. and Sen, A. K. (2002) *India: Development and Participation*, Oxford University Press, Delhi)

There is a case study on how a credit cooperative- an NGO in Malaysia helped in expanding capabilities of its members. As a youth social club in the early 70s it tried in improving the socio-economic status of estate workers by conducting tailoring classes and offering tuition and preschool instruction to the children of plantation workers. The target of CUM(national credit Union) was marginalized groups and it assisted by improving their capabilities. "CUM's focus, in terms of the conversion factors that were earlier discussed, is largely directed at the social characteristics of the communities that it works with". (1) Personal: Developing new routines, as the disadvantaged had to learn routines and ways of doing things e.g. those women with no experience of doing business or being employed learnt to lead and plan others, learnt new tasks etc. (2) Social: There were regular meetings which helped in communication, help forge connections among fellow disadvantaged individuals, which was necessary for the execution of the activities. They learnt about existing capability constraints and "learnt practices that would help overcome the norms and conventions that support the path dependent nature of capability-restricting institutions". (3)institutional: The formation of networks lay the basis for a fresh set of rules and routines that were needed to overcome negative institutionalized rules and norms. Meetings of stakeholders helped in forming common goals of CUM and shared among members. (Shankaran Nambiar, "Capabilities, conversion factors and institutions", School of Business Manipal International University Malaysia Copyright of Progress in Development Studies is the property of Sage Publications, Ltd.)

VI. Cultural services, particularly performing arts

Yoga, sports, urban spaces and centers of public participation as Capability Approach and as developmental approach. The provisioning of cultural services can help in building social structures, networks, skill sets and uplifting disadvantaged groups. In the human development and capability approach, culture is now being recognized as a resource for development. Religious institutions formerly perceived to be diverting investment into 'unproductive' activities, are now welcomed as they undertake activities which could enhance "functionings".

As in agriculture for cultivation, culture has a connotation of cultivation of the mind and representation in art and literature; characterizing a certain lifestyles to create exclusivity as being 'cultured'. However, now with 'popular culture' in vogue, it has become more mass based and marketable - a matter for private or national investment. UNESCO (the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization) supports sites of 'cultural heritage', such as the walled city in Lahore or the Medina in Fez (Serageldin and Martin-Brown 1999)¹, also possibly from a point of protecting and showcasing diversity of lifestyles and preserving the roots. Sen's acknowledgement of the diversity is a factor in the advocacy of 'cultural freedom'. This is a reflection of the priority given to the individual in the human development approach. (see [Chapter 2](#), Chapter 11, "Introduction to the Human development and Capability Approach, 2009; published by Human Development and Capability Association) Cultural aspects of life could be a pointer to the functionings that an individual need to "do" and "be" for life considered as quality life. As in cultivation, what needs to done and to become is in terms of knowledge acquisition and skill set training and social skill building, application of those learnings. In this context, inadequacies of public education system could be bridged with private initiatives while a case could be made out that state policy also encourages imparting of education menu which is composite of education from development perspective along with building human capital as is understood in utility theory i.e. to enhance efficiency predominantly in business enterprises and from perspective of knowledge and skills for the sake of knowledge and skills. (<http://asmarterplanet.com/blog/2013/07/when-small-businesses-use-cloud-and-mobile-to-go-global.html>) Appadurai, A. (2004) 'The capacity to aspire: Culture and the terms of recognition', in V. Rao and M. Walton (eds) *Culture and Public Action*, Stanford University Press, Palo Alto, CA

As William A. Jackson(2005) says "Capabilities, Culture and Social Structure" 2005, Review Of Social Economy, Vol. Lxiii, No. 1, March 2005 Department of Economics and Related Studies, University of York) the capability approach aims to improve upon utility maximization as a measure of welfare by laying stress on activities and participation in society instead of perceived pleasure. This leads to "functionings" which could also include participative cultural activities.

Probable interdependence of Capabilities and Functionings could help public policy and marketing framework

Some functionings are not only the result of capabilities, but also their prerequisite. There is a dual role of some functionings as both ends and means. Capabilities as an environment facilitating exercise of freedoms to make choice need some instruments for that exercise such as healthy mind free from prejudice, disorders or perceptions and attitudes leading to negative thoughts, which could constraint freedom. This has important implications. It supports a policy that ensures for everyone an initial endowment of (1) mental and physical health, (2) education, and (3) other functionings with a direct or indirect impact on capabilities. Thus functionings could prove to be tool for capability.

Though capability is fundamental to functionings, ultimately, either looking at it from cause or effect, how mental functionings may also be an indirect requirement for capabilities because they ensure the absence of mental disorders or negative thoughts, both of which are relevant constraints on freedom. Mental health can affect both the “real” capability set and the capability set as perceived by the individual. In detail, this argument has four premises: (1) the perception of opportunities and the ability to grasp the same are necessarily required for the freedom to make a choice (2) negative moods and emotions are associated with cognitive distortions; often limit the ability to perceive and benefit by an opportunity and that (4) some functionings could help in ameliorating negative moods and emotions where cultural and basic services can play a positive role (Forgas et al. 2004) (Chaudhari and Reboud 2003).

Sen (1996, p. 52) implies that those who have low expectations due to repression are unfree and that each person is a “doer and a judge” (Sen 1985a). Sen calls this type of freedom, agency freedom (Sen 1985a). Cultural services and integrated basic services can impact how mental faculties are trained, how cognitive processes from perception to attitudes formation and belief systems are formed becomes all relevant and needing holistic knowledge input. Sen’s critique of market catering human resource as implied in ‘human capital’ development vis-à-vis ‘social capital’ development through capability approach wherein “a sense of community facilitates the emergence of consensual social norms” is significant in this context. The concept of social capital can be extended to definite links between cooperative action and development. (Sen 2002 pp 108). Such holistic approach can certainly benefit by cultural service as knowledge and practice. (Sen 2002). (With reference to the healthcare system A. Gandjour Institute of Health Economics and Clinical Epidemiology, University of Cologne, Cologne, Germany e-mail: afschin.gandjour@uk-koeln.de 123 346)

Functionings such as health and social relationships are associated with happiness (Donovan et al. 2002). Likewise happy people are likely to be more proactive about health and social relationships (Diener and Seligman 2004). There is also a reinforcement e.g. if in a negative mood, a person gives up easily. This could be important from point of motivation for consumption of services which are essential for capability development. (Forgas et al. 2004). (Afschin Gandjour, “Mutual dependency between capabilities and functionings in Amartya Sen’s capability approach” *Social Choice Welfare* (2008) 31:345–350 Published online: 1 December 2007 © Springer-Verlag 2007)

Social infrastructure development as significant public sector input

The discussion on this could answer the question of **Public Policy vs. Private enterprise and initiatives** in provisioning and delivery of basic services and cultural services which help overcome limiting factors affecting an individual which “inhibit or encourage the transformation of characteristics into functionings” (Sen, 2000; Robeyns, 2005). These factors are: **(a) personal characteristics; (b) social characteristics; and (c) environmental characteristics.**

Personal characteristics “include a person’s intelligence, psycho-motor skills, metabolism, physical or mental handicaps, and height” which affects person’s capability. With given resources and conversion factors, an individual is made capable to secure a set of possible vectors (i.e. sense and direction) of functionings (i.e. capabilities). From this set, an individual has the choice of realizing the functioning he values or has reason to value (in that particular space and at that particular time).

Social characteristics include person’s social environment and structure as represented by social norms, customs, practices, opportunities, caste, creed, religion which impact person’s ability to be vector to functionings. The removal of blocks to conversion of social characteristics into functionings would fall on shoulders of private social sector initiatives –of both kinds –profit and non-profit organizations apart from what could be imparted as broad based education policy from public policy and interventions. Social cultural

organizations working with similar broad based philosophy of capability approach could play significant role as cultural activities impart some vectors to the path of functionings.

The third conversion factor is made up of **environmental characteristics** such as the provision of public goods (such as parks, street lighting, water supply), climate, and infrastructural facilities. These are very areas in which government investment in infrastructure development can have direct bearing on functionings such as leisure time activities, entrepreneurial growth or functionings of health and education in absence of medical facilities or educational institutes, functionings of mobility or commerce and industry, employment opportunities, public spaces for gardens, sports ground, hobby centres, centres of culture, arts, crafts and particularly performing arts, roadways for transport, means of mass transport and communication, in Indian context IT centres in rural area and in urban slums. If government does not provide parks, people who have the time for leisure may not be able to enjoy the functioning of leisure. Of more composite nature of such provisioning is concerned, the example of development of culture city as in case of Istanbul or riverbank development as in case of Sierra Leone as a cultural centre, ecosystem space development in urban centres, provisioning dwellings for distressed people are some examples where the role of public sector could be undisputable and also could be additionally advocated from point of market development of services sector with emphasis on cultural aspects. These projects are the examples where public policy and government intervention where huge resources are required to be deployed without immediate and directly related economic rate of return is feasible or where gestation periods for completion of projects are long or where non economic gains in terms of quality of life could outweigh economic gains in aggregate terms. These provisioning would remove blocks to convert macro economic characteristics into functionings for a larger number of persons in an economic system.

While considering investments by public sector to remove environmental constraints, the reference by Dr. Robeyna to Sabina Alkire's "capabilities cost-benefit analysis" taking into account noneconomic capabilities in "Valuing Freedoms: Sen's capability approach and poverty reduction. Part II of Valuing Freedoms", could be an apt approach as she discussed about the female literacy project, a kind of project that would not get funding if the evaluation was only based on a traditional cost-benefit analysis. However, "it had a fundamental and transformative impact on the women students" (p. 256). The intangible benefits included women learning of gender equality and feeling empowered that need not suffer from abuse, that they can solve their own problems despite being women apart from learning to read, and satisfaction of ability to study. Alkire's approach of the capabilities evaluation which takes into account non-quantifiable dimensions can lead to different overall judgments than purely economic judgements but certainly preferable from capability approach. (Dr. Ingrid Robeyns, "The Capability Approach: An Interdisciplinary Introduction" i.robeyns@uva.nl Revised version 9 December 2003 © Ingrid Robeyns 2003 Training Course preceding the 3rd International Conference on the Capability Approach, Pavia, Italy, 6 September 2003)

VII. People centered production and consumption process

Services sector as an economic activity encompassing basic and cultural service has the potential to take capabilities approach from "entitlements" centered commodities provisioning economics to employment generating "capacity" builder considering that services sector is rapidly evolving as a predominant sector engaging labour compared to agriculture and manufacturing. Simultaneously consumers expenditure is more directed to "value added" activities with manufactured products and processed commodities rather than on commodities and manufactured products as in the past. Consumption of saved time made available from automated mass production and economic value of time as a result of convenience and labour saving technologies could lead to new economics of predominantly "functionings" which are activities and which could equally be cultural services of market logic economy.

Sen on 'Social Capital' and 'Human Capital'

Sen opposes notions of "social capital" and "human capital" in use as they confuse ends and means, which regards human life as resource or instrument of economic growth, for which people must be educated and trained and skilled in way that they could be deployed as efficient and productive resource generating competitive returns only or primarily. In this approach, individual is recognised as a means in itself rather than an end for whom the education, health care and other basic achievements are "to better human life and does not have to be justified by showing that a person with a better life is also a better producer". As Kant had noted, there is a categorical need to 'treat humanity, whether in their own person or in that of any other, in every case

as an end withal, never as a means only'. The argument for a people-centred view of economic development that focuses on human agency and social opportunities is at the same time, after ends and means "muddle" sorted out, Sen accords importance of human capabilities also as instruments for economic and social performance" with recognition of "the intrinsic importance of the quality of human life". [p. 7].

It is important to bear in mind: (1) that health, education, and other features of a good quality of life are important on their own (and not just as 'human capital', geared to commodity production), (2) they can also be, in many circumstances, extremely good for promoting personal and social roles. There is no particular difficulty in using the language of 'human capital' if it is also recognised that there are other — more direct — rewards of human health, knowledge, and skill. "While human capabilities have both intrinsic and instrumental value, growth of GNP per head must be seen, primarily and directly, as just having instrumental importance." [p. 81-2]

Social capital is a collective of human capital. It would be greater in width and depth if it were a result of a well networked or related social unit, probably a result of formal and informal institutions working within. Cultural service in this background can be an effective pivot. Jasek-Rysdahl(2001) discusses a community project to strengthen and improve quality of life of residents of a destitute area in California by making an inventory of the inhabitants' capabilities through so-called 'asset mapping'. Capabilities, for this purpose are specific talents, abilities and potential of this neighbourhood to understand what they can do for themselves rather than what external experts can deliver to this community. As people are asked about their capabilities and what they would like to do, and their willingness to use their capabilities to help others, as Jasek-Rysdahl points out, "question makes them much more aware of the degree in which they themselves can be agents of change and improve the quality of their lives and of their neighbours" in small but significant ways like helping others who do not understand English with their language skills or many other life-skills. Point being made is that the development of capabilities either as freedom of choice or specific talents or abilities which could be even latent is an economic objective to be pursued and some cultural services can be an effective tool in the process and that could be prove to be an effective consumption motive for a marketer to deploy resource if that marketer is a facilitator or an institutional interventionist or a non-profit organization. The skill sets that could be imparted would be fulfilling the objectives of capability approach

VIII. Applying the capability approach to education for human capital development

Sen (1992) listed three ways of linking education to the expansion of capabilities. Acquired knowledge and communication skills help in social role by way of debate about collective capabilities and expand them. Education could also facilitate capacity to participate in decision-making processes in a household, community or even national level. It helps in an agency role empowering and distributive role in facilitating the ability of excluded groups to organize socially and politically, gain access to power and join in cooperatives between social groups, households and within families. Overall, education has an interpersonal impact because people are able to use the benefits of education to help others as well as themselves and can therefore contribute to democratic freedoms and the overall good of society as a whole.

The human capital development, thus, could be because of agency role strengthened by education, In this context, it becomes important as to what is imparted in education. Nussbaum (2006a) criticizes an education that is narrowly focused on science and technology at the expense of the arts and humanities as the student's critical and imaginative capacities are equally important. Her list of ten central capabilities reflects this approach that was referred earlier in this study.

IX. Health in the context of the human development and capability approach

As a functionings, the process of generating health i.e. the commodities/resource inputs needed to achieve the state of health outputs is also important. One clear example of a conversion factor in health is education. Numerous studies have demonstrated that educated individuals tend to have lower mortality and morbidity than their less educated counterparts. Moreover, children of educated mothers fare better in terms of health than those whose mothers have less education. These 'conversion factors' occur at the individual, social, institutional (formal or informal) and environmental level. Individual factors that determine how a given resource will be used include, for example, age, gender, metabolic rate, pregnancy, illness and knowledge. Social or family or informal rules as much as formal rules help or constrain in converting resource inputs to health outputs. Our natural or man-made environment can facilitate the efficient (or inefficient) use of given inputs (see [Chapter 2](#) "Introduction to the Human development and Capability Approach, 2009; published by Human Development and Capability Association).

As Sen writes (2002, p660): “The factors that can contribute to health achievements and failures go well beyond health care, and include many influences of very different kinds, varying from (genetic) propensities, individual incomes, food habits and lifestyles, on the one hand, to the epidemiological environment and work conditions, on the other. . . We have to go well beyond the delivery and distribution of health care to get an adequate understanding of health achievement and capability”.

Moreover, people are not always rational when it comes to health matters as in case of smoking, high fat diets and sedentary lifestyles. Individuals and societies can make decisions only if complete or unbiased (e.g. influenced by the pharmaceutical industry) information is available. (Chapter 10 chapter author, Proochista Ariana and Arif Naveed, “Health” in “Introduction to the Human development and Capability Approach, 2009; published by Human Development and Capability Association). Thus, individuals and societies could be positively impacted by availability of information and comprehensive lifestyle approach which could be imparted holistically in a cultural service as yoga if it becomes possible for an individual to choose it.

X. Personal Well-being as Life Style Statement , development and growth

The ability to use commodities is influenced by personal, social, and environmental factors (Robeyns 2000). The type of freedom Sen envisages is positive freedom, i.e., the capacity to do this or be that, in contrast to negative freedom or freedom from constraints. The idea of the capability approach is perhaps best expressed in Sen’s own words: “A functioning is an achievement, whereas a capability is the ability to achieve. Functionings are, in a sense, more directly related to living conditions, since they are different aspects of living conditions. Capabilities, in contrast, are notions of freedom, in the positive sense: what real opportunities you have regarding the life you may lead” (Sen 1987, p. 36). Hence, Sen argues that the functioning bundle a person will achieve in the current period depends on the individual’s current capability set. But he also states that capabilities should not only be valued as a means to achieve functionings, but also intrinsically (Sen 1999). That is, Sen attaches both instrumental and intrinsic value to capabilities.

Sen looks beyond GNP per capita as measure of development and even entitlements to basic goods and services. Following Aristotle, Sen [1990: 44] argues that material things are not valuable in themselves. ‘Commodities’, he says, ‘are no more than means to other ends’ [Sen, 1987: 16]. He wants to focus on what people could achieve with the resources they have. Sen also observes that some people can live substantially better (achieve more) than others with a given bundle of goods and services suggesting that resource-based approach is incomplete and unreliable guide to well-being. [1973] Sen has played a significant role in moving away from the exaggerated emphasis on growth and towards issues of personal well-being, agency and freedom.

Consumption of Cultural services as one amongst other variables in Sen’s Capability Approach needs to be studied if one were to accept Sen’s postulation that ultimately Capability is what facilitates Functioning which is so essential for exercise of freedom of choice by an individual, if one were to develop as a fully functional person in pursuit of wellbeing. As Benedetta Giovanola, in his paper “Personhood and Human Richness: Good and Well-Being in the Capability Approach and Beyond” REVIEW OF SOCIAL ECONOMY, VOL. LXIII, NO. 2, JUNE 2005 Routledge Taylor and Francis Review of Social Economy online^a 2005 The Association for Social Economics, <http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals> aims at “developing the Capability Approach’s (CA) underlying philosophical anthropology and ethics and discusses Capability Approach’s critique of happiness as subjective well-being and defend the idea of ‘flourishing’ which ultimately refers to the Aristotelian concept of eudaimonia. How each person has a different idea of good life as per “adaptive” preference to a bundle of functionings as per his endowments and circumstancesto with which to be happy. The Capability Approach thus leads us beyond the idea of the (utilitarian) economic individual and indicates a different anthropological model—the person.

Moreover, through this interrelation of being, doing and becoming, each one of us finds her or himself to be intrinsically related to the other members of a society, since every other person expresses an anthropological richness and at the same time represents the highest possibility of richness for each one of us. In order to develop these considerations, this paper will first discuss— examining the work of the CA’s major exponents—the topics of happiness and adaptive preferences, in order to gain a better understanding of the CA’s

formulation of two further notions, ‘Good’ and ‘well-being’. (Valérie ReboudCREM Université de Caen Esplanade de la Paix 14032 Caen Cedex
e-mail : reboud@econ.unicaen.fr

XI. Motivation and Consumer behavior

Sen says that “a person’s freedom to convert commodities into functionings is dependent upon the social and political opportunities that are available”. Given a set of individual, social and environmental factors, opportunities that seems are not available in some abstract manner. It is the manner in which people respond to situational factor presenting itself as opportunity that would matter. This would depend upon perceptions, attitudes, beliefs, possibly habits for instance, that guide responses.

According to welfarism, well-being should be valued by utility, measuring happiness or the satisfaction of desires. As a consequence, one’s well-being depends on one’s evaluation of his situation. So that an individual who is denied decent conditions of living can consider himself to be happy or satisfied if he has resigned to his situation, that is to say if he has adapted his preferences to what he is able to get. This process of revision of one’s preferences is called adaptive preferences, one finally prefers what he is able to get. This also influences motivation level. When it comes to partaking in the process of “capability” and/or “for functionings” for a person who is in need, his own motivation to walk some length could be relevant.

Resources in CA could be monetary or knowledge. This study aims to critically evaluate whether provisioning of basic services like education and health and other human development services like culture, skilling, ICT, micro finance to informal economy constituents by a public institutional intervention is justified as a tool to develop markets for these and other services against logic of market economy vis a vis capability approach of Sen. (Hans E. Jensen, Betsy Jane Clary and Wilfred Dolfsma, “Speaker’s Corner: Sen on Public Policy: Private Incentives, Public Virtues?” *Review Of Social Economy*, Vol. Lxviii, No. 2, June 2010 online 2010, The Association for Social Economics, <http://www.informaworld.com>)

The conditions and wills of individuals play an important role in the way we perceive the outcomes of projects. Freedom hence involves both the process of obtaining freedoms and the individuals’ choices to utilize the potential functioning in their specific context. (David A. Clark “Sen’s Capability Approach and the Many Spaces of Human Well-being” *The Journal of Development Studies*, Vol.41, No.8, November 2005, pp.1339 – 1368, 2005 Taylor & Francis)

XII. Role of Life Skills Education

The mental power i.e.cognitive, emotional and social abilities, is making its way into education policies and plans, often under the name of life skills. Life skills were seen as the abilities for adaptive and positive behaviour that enable individuals to deal effectively with the demands and challenges of everyday life. In applying the broader vision of health that encompasses not only physical, but also emotional and social health, life skills were applied on such various topics as prevention of drug abuse and HIV/AIDS, sexual and reproductive health, hygiene, nutrition and violence prevention (UNESCO, 2000b). This vision is based on the Report to UNESCO of the International Commission on Education for the Twenty-first Century (Delors *et al.*, 1996), which stresses the importance of enhancing “inner capacities” in order to meet the challenges of education.

Learning to know: The understanding and use of knowledge, abilities include critical thinking, problem solving and decision-making life skills which are fundamental to informed action.

Learning to be concerns the concept of agency. Related abilities include life skills for coping, self-awareness, esteem, and confidence, aiming at building an identity, valuing oneself, setting goals, etc.

Learning to live together implies feeling affiliated to a group, a category, a society and a culture, and understanding and respecting differences. Related inter-personal abilities include communication, negotiation and refusal, life skills etc. essential to define a person as a social being, in constant interaction with the world.

Learning to do is linked to the mastering of cultural tools, i.e. objects or patterns of behaviour, in order to act. The related abilities are linked to the practical application of what is learned, and need to be associated with life skills in a teaching learning situation.

XIII. Conclusion

While cultural services product looked at as a vehicle for delivery of “to do” as in participative cultural activities and of “to be” as in specific cultural product as yoga or some such culture based activity could be a positive “functionings” in Sen’s Approach as it not only presents itself as an opportunity “to do” and “to be” but in a relationship of interdependence with “capabilities” as offering freedom of choice as a conversion factor in removal of personal constraints of physical and mental health, motivation to grasp “functionings” opportunities, taking care of social constraints as a result of participative nature of activities in a social group setting, accessing additional “functionings”. Even as a content of “education” functionings, cultural product as yoga could add to

life-skill developments and as a part of health “functionings”, as a process of health delivery rather than merchandise service of health delivery, could be effective. In totality, this approach could lead to life style choice of adding ‘richness’ to life. This could be a significant motivator for policy makers and marketers.

References

- [1]. Alkire, S. & Foster, J. (2007) Counting and Multidimensional Poverty Measure
- [2]. Chaudhuri B, Reboud V (2003) On the implicit conceptions of freedom and justice involved in the capability approach. Third conference on the capability approach: from sustainable development to sustainable freedom. 7th–9th September 2003. University of Pavia, Pavia (Italy)
- [3]. Dreze, Jean and Amartya Sen, (2002) *India Development and Participation*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- [4]. Forgas JP, Williams K, von Hippel W (2004) *Social motivation*. Cambridge University Press, New York
- [5]. North, D.C.1990: *Institutions, institutional change and economic performance*. Cambridge University Press.
- [6]. Nussbaum, M.C.(1988) *nature, Function and Capability: Aristotle on Political Distribution*, Oxford Studies in Philosophy, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press
- [7]. Nussbaum, M.C.(2000a) *Women and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press
- [8]. Nussbaum, M.C.(2006) Education and Democratic Citizenship Capabilities and Quality Education, *Journal of Human Development* 7(3), 385-395.
- [9]. Robeyns, I. 2000: *An unworkable idea or a promising alternative? Sen’s capability approach re-examined*. Discussion Paper, Center for economic Studies, University of Leuven.
- [10]. Robeyns, I.2003: Sen’s capability approach and gender equality: Selecting relevant capabilities. *Feminist Economics* 9, 61–92.
- [11]. Sen, A. (1999a) *Development as Freedom*, New York: Knopf. Sen, A. (1999b) “The Possibility of Social Choice,” *American Economic Review* 89(3): 349–378.
- [12]. Sen, A. (1973) *On Economic Inequality*, New York: Norton..
- [13]. Sen, A. 1981. *Poverty And Famines: An Essay On Entitlement And Deprivation*. Oxford: Clarendon Press; New York: Oxford University Press.
- [14]. ——— 2005: The capability approach: a theoretical survey. *Journal of Human Development* 6, 93–114.
- [15]. Sen, A.K.1985a: *Commodities and capabilities*. Oxford University Press.
- [16]. ——— 1992: *Inequality re-examined* (expanded edition with a substantial annexures by James Foster and amartya Sen). Clarendon Press.
- [17]. ——— 2000: *Development as freedom*. Oxford University Press.
- [18]. Sen AK (1985) *Commodities and capabilities*. North Holland, Amsterdam
- [19]. Sen AK (1987) *On ethics and economics*. Basil Blackwell, Oxford
- [20]. Sen AK (1992) *Inequality reexamined*. Clarendon Press, Oxford
- [21]. Sen AK (1996) On the foundations of welfare economics: utility, capability, and practical reason. In:
- [22]. Sen, A. (1995) “Rationality and Social Choice,” *American Economic Review* 85(1): 1–24.
- [23]. Sen, A. (1999b) “The Possibility of Social Choice,” *American Economic Review* 89(3): 349–378.
- [24]. Sen AK (2002) Why health equity? *Health Econ* 11(8):659–666
- [25]. World Health Organization (1992) *ICD-10 International statistical classification of diseases and related health problems*. World Health Organization, Geneva
- [26]. Sen, Amartya. Forthcoming. “Consequential evaluation and practical reason”, in *Journal of Philosophy* (New York).
- [27]. —. 1999a. *Development as freedom*. New York, NY, Alfred A. Knopf, and Oxford, Oxford University Press